| **Student Name:** Kevin Hu |
| --- |

| **Motion**: In ethnically heterogeneous areas, This house believes that governments should pursue policies to make all schools multiethnic (e.g. setting up schools in mixed districts, requiring quotas, preferential subsidisation based on degree of representation) |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 70 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  I think rather than saying 1900s society, illustrate what segregation in these countries/areas look like - we eventually do this by talking about racial disparity and wealth disparity in schooling, but we could have just started with this!  Model   * Clear on how racial mixing works; there is a stance POI here about the extent of mixing and the percentage. * Good on maintaining selectivity of existing selective schools. POI - clear response, but you can also say that there are many free resources one can access etc. * We need to characterise what these AREAs are like; this is probably not about the entire US or Singapore, but specific neighbourhoods or locales.   Argument 1   * On taking slots - good on correlation between wealth and race, but we just assert this. We can use the following analysis to do this; historically, government policies like the Homestead Act, which granted land primarily to white settlers, and the GI Bill, which provided benefits like education and housing loans disproportionately to white veterans, further widened the wealth gap. Continuing practices like redlining and discriminatory lending practices make it harder for people of colour to buy homes, a primary means of wealth accumulation. Disproportionate incarceration rates for Black Americans can lead to lost income, difficulty finding employment, and other economic hardships. * Good on incentives and belief in the value of education. This is a well rounded analysis on why there is a lack right now and how it goes away.   Argument 2   * On stereotypes, is this the only source of stereotypes? There’s a problem solution gap here. * Do we solve police brutality? * I think we definitely need to consider this debate outside of the Western setting and look at Malaysia or Singapore for instance, where this debate occurs more within the framework of racial tension and lack of assimilation, rather than African-Americans, who are still Americans.   I want mechanistic analysis on integration! Explain how direct interaction allows individuals to challenge stereotypes, discover commonalities, and build relationships. Shared experiences foster empathy and break down barriers. Yet - this is only possible when it involves equal status between groups; proximity without these conditions can exacerbate existing tensions. School solves this! Explain the role of teachers, extra-curriculars, mixing and so forth.  05:53 | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Joanne Lau |
| --- |

| **Motion**: In ethnically heterogeneous areas, This house believes that governments should pursue policies to make all schools multiethnic (e.g. setting up schools in mixed districts, requiring quotas, preferential subsidisation based on degree of representation) |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 69 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  How do you protect them? The opening is very illustrative but not very clear. We can’t giggle through our opening!  Set-up + Rebuttal   * Choice exists, but is this choice enacted upon? * You do have to prove there is some positive path forward. What is this? What do you think the government should do? * We needed more responses, especially on the framing of this debate as set in the US. You should push and make this debate about Singapore and Malaysia, where racial tensions are far more acute - talk about the source of the stereotypes and why schooling doesn’t just flip it.   Argument 1   * Where do these stereotypes come from? Why is everyone so racist and horrible? You assert these behaviours, rather than building them up. Why do they self select into segregated friend groups? What is the analysis for this? * Good on pre-requisite, how do you fulfil it? * What is the impact of this argument? * No analysis here is school or child specific - we have to pay closer attention to the motion!   POI: how or why would they interact? What truly solves the root problem that you want to fund? Why wasn’t this explained in set-up properly?  Argument 2   * Why do we care so much about backlash? How does it hurt the outcome both debates want? Are such racist societies based in ethnically heterogeneous areas in the first place? I’m confused by this.   Why do we say ‘we tell you’, ‘right’, ‘our side’ so frequently?  06:22  We have to ask POIs aggressively once we’re done speaking. We didn’t ask any to Gemma. | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Gemma Yeung |
| --- |

| **Motion**: In ethnically heterogeneous areas, This house believes that governments should pursue policies to make all schools multiethnic (e.g. setting up schools in mixed districts, requiring quotas, preferential subsidization based on degree of representation) |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 70.5 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  Good opening. I think we want to explain why the motion is the best way forward, focusing on the solvency of your mech. Impact this out properly - that this is our best chance or only chance - and why taking this chance matters so much. Characterise what these societies or communities look like and why racism exists; is it because of hatred, or is it because they have never interacted with them without prejudice? You need to analyse why people are engaged in racism to be able to explain how it goes away.  Rebuttal   * Good on continuance; I think we also want to wash this segment out of the debate, because why would exceptionally racist people live in the same neighbourhood or area as other races? Look at the motion! * We need to characterise what these AREAs are like; this is probably not about the entire US or Singapore, but specific neighbourhoods or locales. * On integration in schooling - explain how direct interaction allows individuals to challenge stereotypes, discover commonalities, and build relationships. Shared experiences foster empathy and break down barriers. Yet - this is only possible when it involves equal status between groups; proximity without these conditions can exacerbate existing tensions. School solves this! Explain the role of teachers, extra-curriculars, mixing and so forth. We reference all these ideas but need to go step by step in explaining how we reach the impact. * Talk about generational change and differences, and how these societies are changing and **need to change** anyways! * Good on choice and who has access to it.   The case identifies well that there is a correlation between wealth and race, but we just assert this. We can use the following analysis to do this; historically, government policies like the Homestead Act, which granted land primarily to white settlers, and the GI Bill, which provided benefits like education and housing loans disproportionately to white veterans, further widened the wealth gap. Continuing practices like redlining and discriminatory lending practices make it harder for people of colour to buy homes, a primary means of wealth accumulation. Disproportionate incarceration rates for Black Americans can lead to lost income, difficulty finding employment, and other economic hardships.  I think we definitely need to consider this debate outside of the Western setting and look at Malaysia or Singapore for instance, where this debate occurs more within the framework of racial tension and lack of assimilation, rather than African-Americans, who are still Americans.  The structure towards the end of the speech becomes slightly messy. Ideally we should have a second speaker argument.  06:12 | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Jodie Li |
| --- |

| **Motion**: In ethnically heterogeneous areas, This house believes that governments should pursue policies to make all schools multiethnic (e.g. setting up schools in mixed districts, requiring quotas, preferential subsidisation based on degree of representation) |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 69 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  Good opening, but what then is the path forward? I have some off handed suggestions on public housing policies etc. but no real substantiation on this.  Rebuttal   * Why do we have to say they didn’t have any new material - is this true? We’ve talked about saying statements like these and the impression this has on the judge in the round. * Why will they continue to opt out, time and time again? Why do they believe what their parents do, compared to what they’re taught at school like Gemma argues? * Public housing + similar background - we need to analyse why racism or hatred exists in the first place to be able to argue how we solve it; you have to set the problem up! Where do these stereotypes come from? Why is everyone so racist and horrible? You assert these behaviours, rather than building them up. * POI: Why is economic deprivation the mechanism? Do we think this works?   Argument 1   * Is this new compared to what the first speaker says? * Less than and undeserving - good analysis. Why do kids buy into this? Especially when teachers or the government tell them otherwise? * Are such racist societies based in ethnically heterogeneous areas in the first place? I’m confused by this. * Unpack why cultural differences are not resolvable rather than just saying this! What’s the **mech** here? * I think we have to build up racial tensions - and why they backfire; forced integration can sometimes backfire and exacerbate existing tensions between ethnic groups. If not managed carefully, it can lead to increased conflict and resentment within the school community. A focus on creating inclusive environments within existing schools, regardless of their ethnic makeup, might be a more effective approach.   We needed more responses, especially on the framing of this debate as set in the US. You should push and make this debate about Singapore and Malaysia, where racial tensions are far more acute - talk about the source of the stereotypes and why schooling doesn’t just flip it.  What’s the positive comparative? How does your side achieve any change?  06:05 | | | | | | |